Data is very interesting in that you can use it to make practically any claim you want. Specifically in sports, the same data can be used to make a case both for and against a player when analyzing them. Therefore, this exercise is difficult as there truly is no wrong answer about if Pitcher A or Pitcher B would be a better pick for our team. Through this report, I plan to compare both players’ stats to each other, first focusing on their basic stats before moving on to more advanced stats, before coming to a conclusion. By the end of this report, I hope you agree with me that Pitcher A is ultimately the right choice for our team.

Starting with the most basic of stats, Pitcher A is five years younger than Pitcher B. While certainly not advanced at all, this is a big advantage for Pitcher A, as they are more likely to have more valuable years ahead of them. Moving on to games played and innings pitched, Pitcher B appeared more in games and was more consistent in the number of games he appeared in compared to Pitcher A. This could be a red flag that Pitcher A is injury prone, but we will need more evidence to support that claim. While not the greatest stat to use in evaluating pitchers, Pitcher A does give up less home runs than Pitcher B, meaning he will give up less big hits and hints that he is more of a groundout pitcher than a strikeout pitcher. This claim is supported by the fact that Pitcher B strikes out significantly more batters, showing he is more high-risk, high-reward. The two pitchers seem to be equal in terms of control, as Pitcher A hits more batters, but Pitcher B has more wild pitches over the four-year span. Finally, Pitcher A seemed to be slightly better in terms of hitting statistics against the two over the four years.

Moving on to the advanced stats, Pitcher A has a better average BABIP and a higher BABIP every year except year 2 compared to Pitcher B. This means Pitcher A draws more outs than Pitcher B, supporting my claim from earlier that Pitcher A is more of a groundout pitcher. A similar trend exists for WHIP, where Pitcher A has a lower average in the stat and did better than Pitcher B every year except year 2. Since WHIP stands for Walks plus Hits per Inning Pitched, this gives even more evidence that Pitcher A seems to do a better job at generating outs. As for ERA+, which measures ERA compared to other pitchers and factors in things such as ballpark, Pitcher A once again has a higher value every year except year 2 and a higher average overall. FIP, or Fielding Independent Pitching, is about equal for both players, showing they are about the same in terms of how effective they are factoring out their defense. One thing to note, however, is that the gap between average FIP and average xFIP is higher for Pitcher A, showing he may be getting lucky in this category. SIERA, a similar stat to FIP, further emphasizes the point that Pitcher A may be getting lucky based on his home field and the defense behind him, as it is a higher average than Pitcher B. However, Pitcher B’s SIERA has been rising over the past four years, so that could be a sign of caution. Finally, Pitcher A has a higher WAR over the four-year span in all three categories (fWAR, bWAR, and WARP) compared to Pitcher B, showing he is more valuable to his team. One final thing to note is that both the basic stats and the advanced stats show Pitcher A has been slightly decreasing in effectiveness over the last four years, which is definitely something to worry about.

While you can certainly make a case for both players, I believe Pitcher A is better because he leads most stat categories, both basic and advanced, compared to Pitcher B. While there is an argument to be made that his best days are behind him and he might be injury prone, I am willing to take those risks for the talent upside he has compared to his counterpart. Additionally, Pitcher B will be 35 next year, so there is more proof that his best days are behind him in my opinion. I hope this report and analysis is useful to you, and I hope you agree with my decision.